“Water and Mining - Impact avoidance through mine design and planning, balancing operational needs with the environmental sensitivity”
prepared for
Conference on
THE MITIGATION HIERARCHY: REDUCING THE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS OF LARGE-SCALE AND SMALL-SCALE MINING
MAY 27-28
ULAANBAATAR, MONGOLIA

By
Paul Robinson, Research Director
sricpaul@earthlink.net
Southwest Research and Information Center
PO Box 4524
Albuquerque, NM 87196
www.sric.org

The Esperanza TSF was commissioned in late 2010, with SRK acting as technical advisors. The facility was designed to store a maximum of 750 million tonnes of copper tailings [produced at 95,000 ton per day].
Source: - http://www.srk.cl/es/node/2375
Best Practices Methods for Water Protection and Reuse in Mining

Energy Production – Use of low-water consumption renewable energy in mining is growing and use water consuming coal and nuclear reactor power is slowing.

Tailings Management – Use of maximum water and reagent recycle tailings management applying dry-stack, past and highly thickened tailings methods is growing rapidly.

Use of below grade disposal NRC in USA recommends below grade disposal as prime option.

Mt. Polley tailings dam failure review panel recommends use of dry tailings and reduced use of water covers. “No more business as usual.”

Full Hydrologic and Water Quality Characterization and Monitoring throughout project life is fundamental to avoiding long-term and irreversible impacts to water resources - New Mexico Mining Act of 1993 requires full cumulative hydrologic impact assessment before operations can begin

US Environmental Protection Agency proposed rules – 40CFR192 requires full characterization of background water quality and hydrology and water quality restoration for ore zone, adjacent portions of aquifer
Mining with Renewable Energy Works in Difficult Conditions – Examples of Wind Power at Operating Mines includes: Diavik Mine, Canada and Punta Colorado, Chile


Punta Colorado Copper Mine – Barrick Gold – 20 MW - $50 million – In operation 2011
Renewable Energy Generation at Decommissioned Mines

Questa, New Mexico Molybdenum Mine – 1.25 MW photovoltaic system – in operation on decommissioned portion of a tailings pile

Senftenburg, Germany - 166 MW photovoltaic system being built at former open pit mine - 78 MW in operation in 2011 - at: http://inhabitat.com/abandoned-german-open-pit-mine-turned-into-worlds-largest-solar-park/

Ore Processing Mill Tailings – Best Practices – Dry Tailings in Below Grade Disposal Sites

Mt. Polley tailings spill in August 2014 has lead to its first set of recommendations from an Expert Panel that:
“...concluded that the future requires not only an improved adoption of best applicable practices (BAP), but also a migration to best available technology (BAT). Examples of BAT are filtered, unsaturated, compacted tailings and reduction in the use of water covers in a closure setting. Examples of BAP bear on improvements in corporate design responsibilities, and adoption of Independent Tailings Review Boards.” Mt. Polley Independent Expert Panel Report, Exec Summary p. 8/156

Churchrock tailing tailings dam spill among events that led to adoption of US Nuclear Regulation Commission (NRC) regulatory standard since mid-1980s
- “Criterion 3—The "prime option" for disposal of tailings is placement below grade, either in mines or specially excavated pits (that is, where the need for any specially constructed retention structure is eliminated).”

KEY DESIGN AND OPERATION CRITERIA
- Below-grade disposal requires all tailings material to be below original land surface (“grade”)

- Filtered, unsaturated, compacted tailings possible using existing technology to produce high-density thickened, paste or dry tailings. Provides for maximum recycle, reduce tailings disposal site area and reduced risk of short of long-term tailings dam failure;

- Reduction of use of water covers in a closure setting.
Mt. Polley Tailings Dam Failure and Spill


http://www.miningwatch.ca/blog/mount-polley-and-failure-compliance

http://commonsensecanadian.ca/mount-polley-spill-may-far-bigger-initially-revealed/

Tailings dam failure in Russia: Karamken, Magadan Region - 2009

08.09.09. Продолжается разрушение ограждающей дамбы и сток пульпы в реку Хасын
Puerco River Contaminant Source:
Church Rock Uranium Mill Tailings Spill,* July 16, 1979
*Largest release of radioactive wastes, by volume, in US history

United Nuclear Corp. Uranium Mill
Tailings Dam, July 16, 1979

Dam breach location,
July 17, 1979

NMEID
Sampling in
Puerco R.
after spill

Puerco River
warning sign

Livestock tracks in Puerco River
downstream of spill, July 17, 1979

Community leaders Larry J. King (L)
and Robinson Kelly addressed long-
term impacts of spill in 2009.

Photos courtesy of Southwest Research and Information Center, New Mexico Environmental Improvement Division, Albuquerque Journal.
Extensive seepage into Colorado river floodplain after facility operator bankruptcy being address through tailings relocation to below –grade disposal site. Moab (Utah) Tailings Relocation Project that is excavating and transporting a 16,000,000-ton inactive tailings pile to a below grade disposal site 30 km north. Images show: 1) Atlas tailings pile before project began 2) tailings removal in progress, and 3) view after additional tailings removal

Crescent Junction Disposal Site uses below-grade tailings disposal with windborne particles releases controlled daily cover using material excavated to allow below grade disposal.

From: http://www.gjem.energy.gov/moab/
Below-grade tailings disposal system using phased, lined cells designed and permitted in Colorado, USA

Source: “Uranium Tailings Facility Design and Permitting in the Modern Regulatory Environment”
Below-grade disposal proposed for mill tailings disposal for Pena Ranch uranium mill, New Mexico (from design provided to NRC, permit application proposed but not filed)
High Density Thickened Tailings (HDTT) Storage

- Thickened tailings, as the name suggests, involves the mechanical process of dewatering low solids concentrated slurry. This is normally achieved by using compression (or high rate) thickeners or a combination of thickeners and filter presses. High Density Thickened Tailings (HDTT) are defined as tailings that have been significantly dewatered to a point where they will form a homogeneous non-segregated mass when deposited from the end of a pipe.

Surface Paste Tailings Disposal
Paste tailings are defined as tailings that have been significantly dewatered to a point where they do not have a critical flow velocity when pumped, do not segregate as they deposit and produce minimal (if any) bleed water when discharged from a pipe.

Dry Stacking of Tailings (Filtered Tailings)
- Dewatering tailings to higher degrees than paste produces a filtered wet (saturated) and dry (unsaturated) cake that can no longer be transported by pipeline due to its low moisture content.
Illustrations for Understanding Tailings Dewatering Options

Cost vs Benefit to Recover Tailings Water

SLURRY RHEOLOGY VS. WT % SOLIDS
“Paste – The Future of Tailings Disposal?
- In the last decade paste technology has progressed from a research based backfill idea to a widely accepted, cost effective backfill method with the potential to radically change the way tailings are disposed.

Paste is simply dewatered tailings with little or no water bleed that are non-segregating in nature. It can be ‘stacked’ on surface and the risks associated with dam failure significantly reduces since there is no liquid containment and therefore no mechanism for the tailings to travel for tens of kilometres downstream in the event of a containment failure.
- The operating costs for the preparation and transportation of paste may be higher but life-of-mine cost analysis shows comparable costs to conventional disposal with significant environmental benefits. In addition, the eco-political impact of non water-retaining tailings dams could reduce permitting time considerably.

“Highly-Thickened Tailings, Such as “Paste tailings,” offer effective disposal alternatives as standard industry methods for tailings disposal receive mounting economic and social scrutiny, paste may become an increasingly attractive option.”


A paste deposit, as shown here, is one alternative among many in a range of possible thickened tailings formulations. The right choice for any specific tailings application depends on a variety of factors.
Uncontrolled flow from released from artesian wells created for use in aquifer tests at uranium exploration site has resulted in significant drop in flow at a natural spring that is sole water source for a Soum (county) in southeast Mongolia.

Pre-drilling environmental assessment identifying water sources and hydrologic conditions may have been able to prevent this damage.

Water waste and unknown groundwater conditions leads to dramatic reduction in water supply.
Failure to conduct hydrologic characterization or monitoring water sources results in reduced flow at the sole water source for people and their livestock in Ongon Soum, Sukhbaatar Aimag, Mongolia.
Livestock of family that lived at and used Bor Ovoo Spring to which they will never be able to return

Herder born at Bor Ovoo and his son looking at rust-stained water in 2013 being provided by Oyu Tolgoi at proposed Bor Ovoo Spring replacement site

Water resources in desert regions are unique and irreplaceable – Avoidance of impact is fundamental to water resource protection as mitigation likely to be difficult to impossible
Herder born at Bor Ovoo Spring said the spring was used regular by 10 – 20 families and their livestock but was only water available in early winter – into January - and was used by 50 - 100 families and their livestock as well as wild animals. Lack of extra land and water in region eliminates application of “mitigation by offsets” and effective family or livestock relocations.
Water from pipes inside OT fence flowing toward Proposed Bor Ovoo Spring replacement site in 2013

Water at proposed Bor Ovoo Spring appears to soak into ground completely within 200 meters of pipes from which it flows in 2013
Camels waiting at decades old Watering well now dry as a result of draining of soil water due to erroneous monitoring well construction that has yet to be repaired

Camels reacting to people approaching well hoping for water to be filled into their drinking trough
“The cascading well” is one of the six improperly constructed monitoring that wells that has drained the soil water decades old wells into top Gunii Hooloi deep aquifer; none of which have been repaired to prevent continued draining of soil water to the deep aquifer.

Decades old livestock water well where the soil water level has dropped significantly due to the lowering of the water level in the soil water aquifer due to faulty and unrepaired monitoring wells nearby.
Failure to construct boreholes as designed creates devastating water losses – Oyu Tolgoi’s ESIA says “Typical Borehole Design” – ESIA Water Resources Management Plan p. 32 of 48

“The design of boreholes in the Gunnii Hooloi and elsewhere has evolved over the life of the Project such that the permitted design is more protective of the shallow groundwater aquifers present in the basin. A typical well design (GH05-PB01) is presented below. Pertinent points being:

1. Surface seal around the borehole to prevent any infiltration from the surface into the annulus.
2. Solid casing from surface down to the aquifer unit.
3. **Upper sections of the well bore grouted with impermeable material (bentonite or similar)** to ensure that any surface or shallow aquifers units in the borehole are sealed and cannot flow into the annulus.
4. Gravel pack around the casing and screen through the aquifer section. This design will be adapted as required to reflect the local hydrogeology; however the key principle of preventing flows between hydraulically distinct shallow and deep aquifer horizons will be maintained in all designs.”

OT acknowledges that contractors failed to include “**grouted with impermeable material (bentonite or similar) to ensure that any surface or shallow aquifers units in the borehole are sealed and cannot flow into the annulus**” in 6 of 10 monitoring wells resulting in the surface and shallow aquifers being drained of water which flowed in down into the deeper aquifer. None of the erroneously constructed wells have been repaired and the damage to the soil water aquifer continues. Other traditionally used wells show dropping water levels as the effect of the drainage of the soil water aquifer spreads
OT Map showing the 6 wells it acknowledges were constructed incorrectly resulting in the draining of the soil water aquifer.

OT well completion record showing that borehole space around casing pipe was filled with only gravel pack without any impermeable material required to prevent draining of soil water.
Oyu Tolgoi estimates 561 l/s of water will be lost by evaporation at the tailings site (111 l/s) or locked in tailings (450 l/s).

“The average water demand during the initial years of 100,000 tpd mine production is predicted to be 696 L/s [if there is] no water recovery from the underground or open pit mines.”

Project Description p. 42 of 77

This water is potentially recoverable by paste or dry tailings disposal and represents up to 80% of the water needed from the Gunii Hooloi groundwater extraction zone

450 l/s = 3.8 trillion cubic meters per year
The March 2013 Oyu Tolgoi Technical Report states, “In 2005, Golder Associates completed an alternative TSF design with central discharge of a tailings paste thickened to densities as high as 70% solids. The capital and operating costs, and operational complexities, of a paste tailings system were found to be high compared to those associated with conventionally thickened tailings, and the reduction of water consumption by using paste was small. Therefore, this option was not pursued further.”

In its February 2013 Tailings Brief, Oyu Tolgoi states, In 2006/2007 when Oyu Tolgoi was planning its tailings storage facility, further reducing the water content to 20% through the use of dry stack technology was not identified as a realistic option. Even a middle ground option, so called ‘paste tailings’ (containing 22-24% water), was not found to be justified due to the complexity and high costs that would be required at an operation on the scale of OT.

In sharp contrast to those conclusions, Oyu Tolgoi’s 2006 Mining and Processing EIA finds: “The combined use of high-compression thickeners to increase the deposition density of tailings and of decant towers to reduce the size of the tailings pond area has the potential to reduce make-up water requirements and thereby reduce the water demand form the Gunii Hooloi well field. These water saving opportunities increase the rate of recirculation of process water and investigations are continuing as to the feasibility and cost implications” states in Section 2.4 Project Alternatives.

---------------------------------
Since 2006-7 when Oyu Tolgoi’s tailings facility design was developed, the use of high-density thickened, paste and dry-stack tailings disposal tailings systems at large mines has grown rapidly.
Existing large-scale mine operations as large or larger than Oyu Tolgoi that use high-density thickened tailings, paste or dry stack technology include: Chuquicamata, Chile – 230,000 tons per day; Quebrada Honda, Peru – 147,000 tons per day and Esperanza, Chile – 95,000 tons per day.

Perceived and realized benefit of High-Density Thickened, Paste and Dry Stack Tailings management include both reduced operating cost and potentially large reductions in water use

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feature</th>
<th>Economic/engineering benefits</th>
<th>Environmental/social benefits</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Similar capital cost and reduced operating cost compared with wet disposal</td>
<td>Overall economic benefit</td>
<td>Less resources applied to end of pipe and less corrective action</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Costs accrued during operations</td>
<td>Reduced requirement for bonds and provisioning</td>
<td>Costs met by operator, no long-term liability to community</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Increased deposit strength</td>
<td>Reduced risk of facility failure</td>
<td>Avoids offsite environmental and safety impacts</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Decreased land footprint by at least doubling practical stacking height</td>
<td>Reduced land purchase cost</td>
<td>Reduced sterilization of productive land, reduced clearing</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Decreased demand for borrow materials for construction</td>
<td>Less transport and construction</td>
<td>Reduced clearing for borrow materials, reduced greenhouse gas production in construction</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Reduced risk of leachate seepage</td>
<td>Better leachate and reagent recovery</td>
<td>Reduced risk of ground- and surface water contamination</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Reduces or eliminates ponding and low-strength mud deposits</td>
<td>Increased surface accessibility</td>
<td>Reduced injury to fauna, increased operator safety</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Prompt creation of firm, convex draining surface at completion</td>
<td>Early creation of trafficable surface</td>
<td>Progressive or more rapid rehabilitation</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Easier, better surface leaching and drainage</td>
<td>Early leaching of toxicants from surface</td>
<td>More rapid establishment of vegetation, reduced duration of dust generation</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Potentially large reductions in water use</td>
<td>Reduced need for water collection and supply facilities, pumping energy savings</td>
<td>Reduced footprint from water collection structures or impacts from diversion or abstraction</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Reduced potential for lixiviation</td>
<td>Deposit remains firm and will not flow</td>
<td>Reduced offsite environmental and safety impacts</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Potentially reduced heating, lower water demand</td>
<td>Reduced energy use, cost savings</td>
<td>Lower greenhouse gas emissions</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Reduced reagent requirements</td>
<td>Potential operating cost savings</td>
<td>Reduced pollution risk</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Purposes - The purposes of the New Mexico Mining Act include promoting responsible utilization and reclamation of lands affected by exploration, mining or the extraction of minerals that are vital to the welfare of New Mexico. (69-39-2)

"Reclamation" means the employment during and after a mining operation of measures designed to mitigate the disturbance of affected areas and permit areas and to the extent practicable, provide for the stabilization of a permit area following closure that will minimize future impact to the environment from the mining operation and protect air and water resources. (69-36-3-K)

Financial Assurance – “require by regulation that the applicant file with the director, prior to the issuance of a permit, financial assurance. The amount of the financial assurance shall be sufficient to assure the completion of the performance requirements of the permit, including closure and reclamation, if the work had to be performed by the director or a third party contractor and shall include periodic review to account for any inflationary increases and anticipated changes in reclamation or closure costs. The regulations shall specify that financial requirements shall neither duplicate nor be less comprehensive than the federal financial requirements. The form and amount of the financial assurance shall be subject to the approval of the director as part of the permit application; provided, financial assurance does not include any type or variety of self-guarantee or self-insurance; (69-39-7-Q)
Effective Environmental Impact Assessments require fully design and financial guaranteed reclamation plans before project development

Waste Rock Management Plan “Intentionally Omitted” from ESIA
ESIA Project Description  p.40 of 77
“Preliminary environmental test work has shown that some open pit waste, mainly in the central pit, is potentially acid forming (PAF), but that a significant proportion of waste also has an acid neutralizing potential….

“Design work on the waste rock dump is ongoing and further information on how the Project will ensure that the design, construction, operation and closure of the WRD incorporates good international practice and meets applicable Mongolian standards and IFC and EBRD requirements to mitigate potential impacts is set out in Chapter D9: Waste Rock Management Plan.”

“SECTION D: ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT PLANS
CHAPTER D9: WASTE ROCK MANAGEMENT PLAN
This section is intentionally omitted and will be included with the operations- phase management plans which will be prepared in due course.”

No reclamation plan was provide for waste rock in the ESIA either, only conceptual goals, though waste is the largest volume of material being generated at the open pit mine and that will be left at the site after mining ceases.
Oyu Tolgoi Intentionally Omitted its Tailings Management Plan from the ESIA

ESIA Project Description p. 35 of 77

“An Independent Tailings Review Board (ITRB) has been established in accordance with IFC Performance Standard 4 to provide independent review and oversight of TSF design and operational management. The ITRB will:
- Review TSF design and operational monitoring during construction and the initial phase of construction;
- Ensure that TSF design, construction and operation is undertaken in accordance with good international industry practice;
- Review the final TSF designs prior to financial close of project financing; and
- Review the final TSF construction as part of the Physical Facilities Completion Certificate for project financing.”

“SECTION D: ENVIRONMENTAL AND SOCIAL CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT PLANS
CHAPTER D10: TAILINGS MANAGEMENT PLAN
This section is intentionally omitted and will be included with the operations-phase management plans which will be prepared in due course.”

No reclamation plan was provided for the tailings disposal site, though tailings are the second largest volume of waste material to be left at the site after mining ceases
Best Practices enhanced by Citizen Enforcement

“Citizen Suit” means “A person having an interest that is or may be adversely affected may commence a civil action on his own behalf to compel compliance with the New Mexico Mining. Such action may be brought against: the department of environment, the energy, minerals and natural resources department or the commission alleging a violation of the New Mexico Mining Act (NMMA) or of a rule, regulation, order or permit issued pursuant to that act;… a person who is alleged to be in violation of a rule, regulation, order or permit issued pursuant to the NMMA; or…the department of environment, the energy, minerals and natural resources department or the commission alleging a failure to perform any nondiscretionary act or duty required by the NMMA;” …(69-39-14)

Civil Penalties may be assessed by the director or the commission for violations of the NMMA including a violation of a regulation of the commission, an order of the director, a permit condition and the order resulting from a hearing. Civil penalties assessed by the director or the commission shall be imposed pursuant to regulations adopted by the commission. Any penalty assessed shall not exceed ten thousand dollars ($10,000) per day of noncompliance for each violation….. (69-39-17)

Criminal Penalties - Any person who knowingly or willfully violates the NMMA, regulations adopted by the commission or a condition of a permit issued pursuant to the NMMA … or fails or refuses to comply with a final decision or order of the commission or the director is guilty of a misdemeanor and is subject to a fine not to exceed ten thousand dollars ($10,000) per day of violation or imprisonment of up to one year, or both. (69-39-18)

Full text of New Mexico Mining Act available in compilation of New Mexico Statutes at: http://www.conwaygreene.com/nmsu/lpext.dll?f=templates&fn=main-h.htm&2.0
New Mexico Mining Act Regulations available at: http://www.emnrd.state.nm.us/MMD/MARP/MARPRulesandRegulations.htm
Design and Operational Practice to minimize or eliminate failures at Existing Tailings Dams:
1) Operations establish and maintain tailings beach to keep liquids from saturating dam;
2) Constructed using engineering multi-layer liner with seepage detection systems
   A) protecting upstream face of dam and
   B) on prepared and compacted “pillotka” below tailings disposal area to prevent infiltration;
3) constructing (or reconstructing) dam with below ground cutoff trench to prevent subsurface
   flow below and through dam;
4) constructing (or reconstructing) dam with wide base structural engineered to prevent
   infiltration;
5) Distribute tailings from multiple discharge points into dam to establish thin layers of tailings to
   reduce infiltration potential and
6) Use of dry, paste or highly-thickened tailings technology maximizes recycle of liquids fand
   minimize liquids volume in tailings dam and cut potential for short and long-term seepage.

Samarta Tailings Dam, Buryatia - Example of (1) tailings beach established to keep liquids from saturating
dam, (5) use of multiple tailings discharge points to establish thin layers of tailings to reduce infiltration potential
and (6) tailings liquid recycle to reduce volume of liquids behind dam.
Full hydrologic system and water quality characterization of water resource monitoring fundamental protection of water resources and prevention of irreversible impacts due to conventional and solution mining.
Figure 3. Schematic of idealized Wyoming Basin uranium roll front deposit showing alteration zones, related mineral components, solution components, and important aqueous chemical reactions for Fe, S, O, and CO₂ (after Granger and Warren, 1974).

Figure 5. Concentration and distribution of uranium in various roll front deposits (after Harshman, 1974).
Figure 6. Concentration and distribution of selenium in various uranium roll front deposits (after Harshman, 1974).

Figure 8. Concentration and distribution of arsenic in various uranium roll front deposits (after Harshman, 1974).
Why is restoration to pre-mining background is so difficult at ISR Mine?:

Consideration of Geochemical Issues in Groundwater Restoration at Uranium 
In Situ Leach Mining Facilities, NUREG/CR-6870, January 2007 
Prepared by USGS for NRC, 

...Because of heterogeneities in the aquifers, the fresh groundwater that is brought into the ore zone 
does not completely displace the residual lixiviant....

...groundwater sweep may cause oxic groundwater from upgradient of the deposit to enter into the 
mined area, making it more difficult to re-establish chemically reducing conditions...

...it is difficult to predict how much time is required or even if the reducing conditions will return via 
natural processes. The mining disturbance introduces a considerable amount of oxidant to the mined 
region.....

Injection of lixiviant - leaching fluid - destroys water quality 
oxidizes & mobilizes contaminants 
changes the redox potential of the rock

Restoration to baseline is not possible as contaminants continue to bleed with time

‘Restored’ water migrates downgradient and follows paleochannel flow paths carrying elevated levels of 
U, Ra, SO₄, O₂

Natural attenuation is unlikely because the net charge on rock particles is negative therefore anions will 
not adsorb to rock particle contamination plume grows with time.
Erdenet Ore Processing Mill Tailings Pond

With its current tailings disposal site approaching its capacity limit, the need for additional tailings disposal capacity provides an opportunity for innovative site selection process, design and operation technology for long-term stability of operations and reduced impact on water and air.